

SECTARIANISM : BREAKING DOWN THE BARRIERS

Acknowledgements

The EIS would like to express its thanks to all who gave of their time and commitment in helping to produce this document.

Office Bearers

Jack Barnett : President

Peter Quigley : Vice President

Sheena Wardhaugh : Ex President

Members of the Working Group

Margaret Nicol - Convener of EIS Equality Committee

Richard Langridge

Mary Matheson

Elizabeth Morriss (2004/5)

Bill Ramsay

Ian Scott

Addie Thomson

Khurshid Usmani (Convener Anti Racist sub committee)

Members of the Equality Committee 2004/05 to 2005/06

Margaret Nicol : Convener

Sonia Kordiak : Vice Convener

Margaret Bryce-Stafford

Patricia Duncan

Kenneth Elder

Elizabeth Fairley

Patricia Fallow

Dorothy Finlay

James Glen

Margaret Kidd

Richard Langridge

Mary Matheson

June McCulloch

Andrew McNeil

Elizabeth Morriss

Frances Murray

Allyson Purdie

William Ramsay

Marion Ross

Ian Scott

Addie Thomson

Bryce Wilson

(Members of the Equality Committee attended certain meetings)

Servicing Official, Veronica Rankin, National Officer (Education & Equalities)

Advisers to the Working Group -Thanks to contributors

Rowena Arshad : Director of the Centre for Education in Racial Equality Scotland

Professor Tom Devine : University of Edinburgh & Research Institute of Irish & Scottish Studies, University of Aberdeen

Professor Gerry Finn : Department of Educational and Professional Studies, University of Strathclyde

Dr Elinor Kelly : Honorary Research Fellow in Race and Ethnic issues, University of Glasgow

Alison Logan : Sense Over Sectarianism

Maggie Lunan : Church of Scotland

Father Ken McCaffrey and Neil Roarty : Scottish Catholic Education Service

Helen Miller : Full time Co-ordinator of the charity Nil BY Mouth

Convener's statement

Sectarianism: Breaking Down the Barriers is the latest addition to the series of EIS papers on equality issues. The others, on gender, racial equality, sexual orientation and poverty have been well-received and used by academics, campaigners, teachers and lecturers.

In compiling the *Breaking Down the Barriers* papers, the EIS has benefited from receiving the advice, knowledge, and expertise of many people from Scotland's academic world, from campaigners for equality and social justice, and from experts working in the field, especially our members.

A Working Group from the EIS national Equality Committee was established in 2004 to consider the issue of sectarianism in Scotland. As in previous works, the Committee was fortunate to draw on the advice and considerable knowledge of experts. These informative and instructive contributions, as well as the considerable reading and research undertaken by the Working Group, tested our attitudes and changed our perceptions of sectarianism. We hope members are provided with the same opportunity. We hope this paper reflects the debate surrounding this issue in Scotland, is an accurate reflection of the views of the contributors, and poses some important questions to teachers and others involved in education.

The EIS does not claim that this paper encapsulates all views or interpretations of what is a complex subject and, for some people, a highly personal issue: nor does it claim to provide answers.

There is a clear divide amongst academic opinion in Scotland about the nature and the extent of sectarian bigotry in Scotland both past and present. This is outlined in the Scottish Executive's research paper, *Religious Discrimination and Sectarianism in Scotland: a brief review of the evidence, 2002-2004* which recommends further exploration of the issue. It is also referred to in some of the contributions by our guest speakers. However, no one who provided us with information doubted its existence.

As complex and personal as our history and perceptions of our history may be, they cannot continue to be used to justify unacceptable behaviour, bigotry, discrimination or violence in the present.

The EIS believes that education must promote principles of equality and social justice. Any behaviour, overt or hidden, which presents barriers to this goal must be challenged.

Central to our commitment to equality and social justice is the development of a comprehensive system of education which is challenging, aspirational and matches the needs of young people, schools and teachers, and the diverse communities in which they live and work.

The EIS wishes to support the campaign to stamp out sectarian bigotry in Scotland and duly recognises the work by a wide range of organisations to this end, not least the Scottish Executive. This political lead is essential and as the largest teachers' trade union in Scotland, the EIS has a crucial role to play.

Margaret Nicol
Convener, EIS Equality Committee
June 2006

The Northern Ireland Community Relations Council (2005) includes in its advice this quotation from a 19th century writer, **William Carleton**, who summed up what he thought was the essence of sectarianism. It is still pertinent to-day:

"If you hate a man for an obvious and palpable injury, it is likely that when he cancels the injury by an act of subsequent kindness, accompanied by an exhibition of sincere sorrow, you will cease to look upon him as your enemy; but when the hatred is such that while feeling it, you cannot on a sober examination of your heart, account for it, there is little hope that you will ever be able to stifle the enmity which you entertain against him".

Introduction

As part of the series 'Breaking Down the Barriers', this EIS paper follows the same practice and purpose. It aims to set people thinking, to inform, influence and support debate. The practice of inviting academics and practitioners to provide evidence for the paper allows the EIS to add perspective and pose questions which enhance or support Institute policy. For the purposes of this paper, the committee decided that it would refer to Catholic/Protestant sectarianism. This is not to ignore the existence of sectarianism within other religions but to recognise that this particular sectarian divide is a long-term and much publicised aspect of Scottish society.

From the outset, listening to contributors, it was evident that there were serious challenges. History, attitudes, structures, real and imagined oppression shape our views of the society in which we live and which we strive to understand. Hard questions were posed by committed and knowledgeable people, perhaps more so than answers.

- ❖ Can the origins and history of sectarianism in Scotland illuminate the present or merely reinforce prejudices?
- ❖ Does challenging sectarianism interfere with the right of individuals to celebrate and commemorate their past?
- ❖ Can the learned process of abusive rhetoric, suggested by some as exclusively the preserve of a minority of football hooligans, be challenged effectively?
- ❖ Does it transfer into discrimination in the workplace and service provision?
- ❖ Is it the case that people cannot deal with the Catholic/Protestant sectarian divide in Scotland on anything other than an emotional level?
- ❖ Why does the continued existence of a public-funded Catholic school sector in Scotland prompt such fierce debate?
- ❖ Is the real, or perceived, oppression of the past still the basis of irreconcilable difference?

Two views of sectarianism

Scottish Executive

The definition of sectarianism which the EIS has adopted is that used by the Scottish Executive and in the very thorough teaching toolkit produced by the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland (CERES) in partnership with Nil By Mouth and the Scottish Human Rights Centre:

“Sectarianism (religious)

A narrow-minded following of a particular belief by members of a denomination that leads to prejudice, bigotry, discrimination, malice and ill-will towards members, or presumed members, of another denomination. Sectarianism can occur in different ways, either at an individual, group, cultural or institutional level.

A denomination is a division or grouping within a faith. For example, Protestants and Catholics within Christianity, Sunni and Shia within Islam, and Orthodox and Reform within Judaism. Denominations within one faith share the same basic (fundamental) elements of the faith but they have differing practices or differing interpretations of specific elements of the faith.

Sectarianism in Scotland is often related to Protestant/Catholic divisions. In tackling sectarianism, it is helpful to understand that sectarianism occurs within other faiths as well as Christianity and is a feature of religious intolerance.” (Sectarianism: Don't give it: don't take it - teachers' tool kit, 2004)

Northern Ireland Community Relations Council

Another perspective comes from the work of the Northern Ireland Community Relations Council. There is a need to reflect upon whether aspects of this view are applicable in Scotland.

The following quotation is from the Northern Ireland Community Relations Council (2005).

“Sectarianism and Anti-Sectarianism

The definition of what we actually mean by 'anti-sectarianism' rather depends on what we mean by 'sectarianism'. It is not fully possible to entrap the nuances of feelings, passions, intellectual nicety or gut reaction conjured up by a discussion of sectarianism. It is not just the bigotry and prejudice, the de-humanised, emotionless, ruthless cynicism that leads to sectarian murder. It is also the ghost at the feast of much polite society in Northern Ireland. While it can and often is the reality of life in working class housing estates, it is equally present in the leafy and apparently more 'civilised' suburbs. It is ingrained into the fabric of society – but what is it?

Sectarianism is not just a matter of economic, social or political consideration: nor is it simply a question of personal attitude or behaviour. It is an historical and cultural phenomenon arising out of religious and political differences and perpetuated by group and self interests.” (Northern Ireland Community Relations Council, 2005)

- ❖ Is it the case that sectarianism remains “the ghost at the feast of much polite society” in Scotland as in Northern Ireland, given the close historical link between the two countries?
- ❖ Is it resurrected only in annual parades or local football derbies?
- ❖ Or is it still a destructive force operating structurally, institutionally, culturally or personally to the detriment of any person or group subscribing to a particular religion or a sect of that religion?

The Context

The EIS invited leading academics, voluntary organisations working in the area of anti-sectarianism and representatives of the Catholic Church and the Church of Scotland to address the Working Group.

All contributions were informative and instructive. Doctor Elinor Kelly, University of Glasgow, Professor Gerry Finn, University of Strathclyde, and Professor Tom Devine, University of Aberdeen and University of Edinburgh, gave of their time to explore their research, writings and beliefs about sectarianism in Scotland. The voluntary organisations working across communities and churches, i.e. Nil By Mouth and Sense Over Sectarianism, provided an insight into their many projects and campaigns. The Director of CERES, Rowena Arshad, explained the background to and purpose of the new education pack aimed at schools and community groups. Representatives from the Catholic Church in Scotland and from the Church of Scotland gave their perspective on sectarianism and the challenges presented by it for their respective religions.

Contributions from Academics

Dr Elinor Kelly

Doctor Elinor Kelly set the context of the discussions by examining the parameters of the debate taking place in Scotland. There are two distinct views. The first is that sectarianism is not an issue as all statistical evidence points to the end of wholesale discrimination against Catholics. Those adhering to this view contend that proof of this is found in the existence of a large Catholic middle class in Scotland and the number of interfaith marriages. It is safe to conclude, therefore, that sectarianism no longer has any impact on the social, political or economic status of Scottish people. The violent sectarian behaviour that is witnessed is that of a minority of the population.

The second view comes from those who believe that there is still a significant and powerful body of opinion which is anti-Catholic and, more specifically, anti-Irish. It is held that sectarianism is structured into society and anti-Catholicism is structured into the unwritten constitution of the UK, for example, the Parliamentary Oaths Act, 1866, which requires allegiance to God and Queen, 26 Anglican Archbishops and Bishops in the House of Lords as representatives of the 'established' church of the state, and the relationship between church and state through the continued existence on the statute books of the Act of Settlement (1701) which restricts the royal succession to Protestants.

The two differing perspectives are held by not only academics from different disciplines but also voluntary organisations and religions, each with compelling arguments for their case. All recognise the existence of sectarianism, recognise it had an impact on society but differ on the extent of its continued influence.

Dr Kelly advised that a number of commentators argue that in the face of increasing secularisation of society there is greater cooperation between all religions. They suggest that religion is under attack and under pressure to prove its relevance to modern society. It would also appear to some commentators that in this increasingly secular society there has been a marked growth in the 'stridently secular', those of no religion, electing to be overtly hostile and critical of established and non-established religions. This is often expressed in the letters' pages of the press and other media outlets. This group of secularists displays particular antipathy to denominational schools and also opposes the teaching of any religion, in any school, as part of the school curriculum or daily life of the school.

Professor Gerry T. Finn

Professor Gerry Finn developed his position, contained in many papers and research, about the egalitarian myth of Scotland. Scotland is not the welcoming place it is fashioned to be. Many people who came here throughout history, not only Irish people, experienced prejudice and discrimination.

He argues that the term sectarianism undermines serious discussion of a deep-rooted problem of anti-Catholic prejudice and anti-Irish racism in the UK. The relationship between prejudice and acts of discrimination is more complex than the lone or isolated groups of bigots portrayed by those who claim sectarianism scarcely still exists. This, he believes, is a comforting but inaccurate view, focusing on individual behaviour rather than on social systems. Moreover, to equate the existence of sectarianism only with discrimination is to fail to recognize the different, and more subtle, forms by which societal prejudices can be expressed. And, the use of the catch-all-term 'sectarianism', obscures whether anti-Catholic or anti-Protestant prejudices are being explored. It misunderstands and underestimates the impact of sectarianism which should be set firmly in the context of discrimination.

Professor Finn argues that the provision of state-funded denominational schools remedied an injustice. Non-denominational schools were actually non-denominational Presbyterian schools, and they offered religious instruction in a form acceptable to Presbyterian parents and the Presbyterian churches. Both Episcopalian and Catholic communities paid local taxes that fully funded the non-denominational, de facto Presbyterian, school system. However, they also had to attempt to finance their own systems of schools, which received only partial state-support. Parliamentarians judged that the 1918 Education Act removed a form of educational discrimination against school pupils solely because they were the

children of Catholic or Episcopalian parents. State-funded Catholic schools have proved to be educationally successful, but they have not only helped move Catholics towards socio-economic equality with their fellow Scots. State recognition of their schools in 1918 was symbolically important to the Catholic community: it was seen as a growing acceptance of themselves, specifically as Catholics, in Scotland. Catholic schools have remained an important symbol of reassurance for that community. That is why swings in popular acceptance of state-funding for Catholic schools matter so much to that community.

He judges that the often ill-informed debate about the existence of state-funded Catholic schools today has distorted any debate on the educational rights of minorities, and not just Catholics. Episcopal, Catholic, Jewish and, if requested, Muslim schools should be viewed as part of the celebration of cultural and social diversity and as a sign of a mature, pluralist democracy. This would be an important part of the development of a truly comprehensive system of schooling offering real choice within it. Professor Finn is opposed to choice in education remaining closely associated with social class factors.

Professor Tom Devine

Professor Tom Devine brings to the debate the discipline of history which sheds light on the considerable volume of data and anecdote leading, he suggests, to a deeper understanding of a personal and complex issue.

He looks, as an historian, at sectarianism and the experiences of employment and life chances which involve not just structures but the soul, spirit and mind of those affected by it. The conclusions, therefore, can be less clinical than those of a social scientist. Social sciences do not necessarily have the range of tools available to the historian e.g. oral history and family stories which add enormously to understanding. A concentration on structures ignores the attitudinal sectarianism which is more complex and more difficult to assess.

The subject of sectarianism, he argues, must be looked at through the history of the Irish and Scots in Scotland which is both Catholic and Protestant. Every year, between 1845 and 1851, at the height of the Great Famine about sixteen thousand persons arrived in the UK as a consequence of Irish immigration. Much hostility was intra-Irish rather than between Irish and Scots. Immigration from Ireland to Scotland, according to the census of 1851 and of 1861, showed that two thirds were Catholic Irish and one third Protestant. There is evidence of tension between the Irish immigrant and the indigenous communities in that period but Scotland had nothing like the violent experience of Liverpool, Boston or Chicago during this time. The Catholic Church archives of the nineteenth century contain little reference to discrimination against Catholics.

His views are that Scotland's problems do not arise from the nineteenth but from the twentieth century. The 1916 Easter Rising period, the interwar years of economic crisis, 1918-1939, and the Irish 'troubles' of the 1960s and 1970s have had a lasting impact. There is a legacy of bitterness on both sides of the sectarian divide. It remains in the folklore of both Catholics and Protestants; stories of oppression and discrimination, violence, rebellion and injustice; stories of extreme poverty and forced emigration. Such bitterness may be time limited to particular communities but it is potent.

Professor Devine maintains that Scotland has changed considerably, politically, socially and economically over the last few decades. It can be argued that structural sectarianism (i.e. labour market discrimination) does not exist to the same extent as in the past. Many of the industrial institutions where structural sectarianism thrived are gone. Sectarianism is both structural and attitudinal. The absence of the structural does not mean an absence of the attitudinal.

Other academic and research data

The academic community is divided on the nature and extent of sectarianism in Scotland today. The Scottish Executive's research paper, "*Religious Discrimination and Sectarianism in Scotland: A brief review of the evidence*",(2002-2004) also refers to the divide among the academic community in

Scotland on the impact and nature of sectarianism and concludes that this complex topic requires to be further explored.

Steve Bruce et al, *Sectarianism in Scotland* (2004) contains a collation of evidence on current social perceptions, attitudes and behaviours.

The authors attack the “anecdotal” nature of other evidence to date. The authors claim that their evidence challenges the misconception that sectarianism was and is rife in Scotland.

They also warn against “ghetto-ising” the Irish Catholic population in Scotland as this is not a homogeneous group and that there was a growth in the Irish Catholic middle class with people becoming teachers, doctors and policemen.

They note that older Catholic men are more likely to say discrimination exists against Catholics, but that only 1% of respondents report any experience of discrimination against them personally due to their religion.

They also criticise misrepresentation of the numbers of sectarian murders which they believe has created a social panic over sectarianism.

Impact of an Increasingly Secular Society

Appendix 6 shows the results of an analysis of the 2001 Census. This indicates that only 42.4% of Scots identify themselves as Church of Scotland and 15.9% as Roman Catholic. 27.6% of Scots indicate no religion.

When compared with religion of up-bringing, there has been an increase of 10% of Scots indicated no current religion. A total of 33% of Scots responded that they had no religion or did not answer that Census question.

The Scottish Social Attitudes Survey (2003) findings indicated that 37% of respondents claimed to have no religion compared to 36% affiliating themselves to the Church of Scotland and 14% with Roman Catholicism.

Those with no religion had risen by 50% in the last 25 years and are now the biggest group within Scottish society.

Of those who did not go to church, 38% had stopped going to church, 28% had never attended church and 11% had no religious up-bringing.

The Survey also indicated a much higher proportion of mixed marriages amongst the younger generation.

This trend away from religion in Scotland can be viewed in a number of ways;

- (i) Christianity is in decline and no longer enjoys hegemony in Scottish society
- (ii) Religious affiliations/divisions have less relevance
- (iii) Scotland is a much less divided and more tolerant society

Alternatively, a number of commentators argue that in the face of increasing secularisation of society there is a need for and evidence of greater cooperation between all religions.

It is also noted that reports of sectarian incidents are often followed by letters to newspapers calling into question the teaching of religion in schools and continued public funding of denominational schools.

Working Against Sectarianism in the Voluntary Sector

Two voluntary organisations, **Nil By Mouth** and **Sense Over Sectarianism**, presented evidence to the Working Group. Both suggest going behind the statistics of crime and public disorder to the individual and sometimes tragic stories of those deeply affected by sectarian abuse and violence in Scottish society.

Nil By Mouth was established as a result of a sectarian killing of a young man after an Old Firm football match in Glasgow. The charity asks a number of key questions.

- ❖ Why did this murder happen in Scotland and, in particular, Glasgow, a city which prides itself on being friendly, cultured and international in its outlook?
- ❖ Why does football remain associated with this type of behaviour?
- ❖ Why does religion still matter in the West of Scotland?
- ❖ Why does Scotland still tolerate this behaviour?
- ❖ Why does sectarianism still cram the letters pages of newspapers and take up headline space?

The founding principles of Nil By Mouth are to encourage people to challenge their own prejudice, to question their own attitudes, behaviour and language. It seeks to persuade organisations to adopt non-sectarian policies and to encourage politicians and community leaders to promote integration and pluralism.

Working closely also with schools, churches, football clubs and community groups, it has developed programmes to help challenge prejudice and sectarianism in society. The focus of the campaign is on Christian bigotry. It has developed a Charter for Change and calls on the Old Firm teams of Glasgow, Rangers and Celtic, to adopt an action plan to eradicate bigotry from their respective clubs (**Appendix 1**).

Sense Over Sectarianism is an overarching organisation which brings together the Old Firm football teams, Glasgow City Council, Nil By Mouth, the Catholic Church and the Church of Scotland in an attempt to address the issue of sectarianism. Football is the focus but their work extends beyond the terracing to local communities and schools, challenging them to examine their behaviour, prejudices and perceptions.

Churches

Representatives of the **Catholic Church in Scotland** and from the **Church of Scotland** addressed the working group separately. Both churches are willing to understand and admit to their respective historical roles in creating the 'sectarian divide'. Both are now strongly committed to supporting the many initiatives established to challenge it.

The 1923 Report to the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, "The menace of the Irish Race to our Scottish nationality", commented on the growth of Irish-Catholicism in Scotland and its effects on the Scottish population. It contained words such as 'alien', 'race' and 'intruders'. The report to the General Assembly of 2002, "The Demon in our Society: Sectarianism in Scotland", apologised for this contribution to sectarianism. The convener of the influential Church and Nation Committee exhorted their followers to challenge their own prejudices and to accept the 'Nil By Mouth' Charter. This is an unequivocal rejection of sectarianism and bigotry (**Appendix 2**).

The representatives of the Scottish Catholic Education Service who addressed the Working Group viewed the Catholic Church as a community rather than a sect. It continues to exercise its right to give approval in terms of religious belief and character to teaching staff as provided in the Education (Scotland) Act, 1980, but also recognises that this is a source of controversy in to-day's world. 'A Charter for a Catholic School' (2005) is its attempt to address this issue. It states that "All staff appointed to a Catholic school are expected to support and promote the aims, mission, values and ethos of the school, as illustrated in this Charter." This, it states, will permit the appointment of non-Catholics within the Catholic sector (**Appendix 3**). The Church emphasises that its Charter shows the explicit commitment of Catholic schools to provide respect for different beliefs and cultures and for interfaith dialogue.

The representatives expressed the concern of the Catholic Church about the continued presence on the statute books of the Act of Settlement (1701) as offensive to the Catholic community. This was raised at the Summit on Sectarianism held on 14 February 2005 by the First Minister.

Both Churches believe that sectarian abuse operates at all levels in Scotland and is not confined to working-class people or areas of deprivation. Nor do they believe it is only a West of Scotland or football problem.

Neither church is of the opinion that sectarianism is an irrelevancy in society. Both have committed to work together in a spirit of ecumenism to build tolerance and understanding of all faiths and cultures. Both agree that there is a considerable gap in understanding and philosophy between the leadership of the respective churches and some groups who claim adherence to them.

The efforts of the Scottish Executive and the First Minister to address sectarianism have the support of the Catholic Church and the Church of Scotland.

Current political context

Sectarianism exercises the minds of politicians of all persuasions in Scotland and is referred to often as 'Scotland's Secret Shame'. As Professor Devine commented, the Scottish Parliament and Executive is a more open system of government. Scotland may be witnessing a growth in confidence and a search for identity which includes an examination of its past. There has been a transformation of the Scottish economy, a change in the role of women, increased social mobility and a massive improvement, with some exceptions, in society's affluence. Tackling the issue of sectarianism, it could be argued, is one part of modernising Scotland.

The First Minister, Jack McConnell, convened a top level summit of 'stakeholders' to discuss ending this shame (**Appendix 4**); CERES, in conjunction with Nil By Mouth and the Scottish Human Rights Centre, was commissioned to produce an anti-sectarian pack for use in schools and community groups. Published by the Scottish Executive, it states that sectarianism should be linked to other equality issues. It is important to explore the issue in depth, have a clear definition of sectarianism and to promote and develop tools to challenge it.

A report was commissioned to look into marches and parades in Scotland '*Reviews of Marches and Parades: A survey of views across Scotland*' – Scottish Executive Social Research (2005); Donald Gorrie, MSP proposed a bill to make sectarian violence a criminal offence; conferences were organised to investigate the issue and a cross-party working group was established to examine religious hatred in Scotland (**Appendix 5**).

Further to the Summit held in February 2005, the First Minister issued an action plan in January 2006, based on its discussions. These are in addition to the many activities which had taken place since the Summit. The actions include:-

- ❖ a review of the powers of local authorities to act on abusive behaviour which surrounds marches and parades
- ❖ new approaches to tackling sectarianism through school, youth and university sectors
- ❖ the introduction of Football Banning Orders as part of the Police, Public Order and Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2006
- ❖ performances of an anti-sectarian play to at least 700 school pupils by summer 2006
- ❖ funding for the STUC to carry out the first-ever comprehensive research into the effects of sectarianism in Scotland's workplaces.

Do the facts support the view that sectarianism is 'Scotland's Secret Shame'?

The Scottish Census of 2001 suggests that Scotland increasingly is becoming a secular society. The two questions asked in the census were about the religion of upbringing and current religion. The Census results indicate a decline in support for the two main religions in Scottish society and an increase in the number of Scots indicating "no religion" (**Appendix 6**).

It is this census and other social surveys that lead some academics, for example, Steve Bruce and Michael Rosie and others, to challenge the idea that sectarianism remains a potent force in Scottish society. In 2004 *'Sectarianism In Scotland'*, by Steve Bruce, Tony Glendinning, Iain Paterson and Michael Rosie, was written in response to the contention that sectarianism remains such a force. The book argues powerfully that there is no evidence to suggest it is and those who do should provide more than anecdotes and perceptions to substantiate their claim.

'The Scottish Social Attitudes Survey: Religion in Modern Scotland', an addition to the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey, was specially commissioned to examine, amongst other attitudes, sectarianism. The findings suggest a perception of sectarianism still in existence and a generational divide in attitudes.

The informative research conducted by Glasgow City Council, *"Sectarianism in Glasgow – Final Report 2002"*, provides an analysis of the level of sectarianism in the city. It found that sectarianism is associated with conflict not difference and is likely to emerge through football. According to the research, some people perceived separate schools and events such as Orange marches and James Connolly marches as provocative. It showed also that there is a belief that other forms of prejudice are as prevalent as sectarianism. However, the survey did point to a mismatch between perceptions and actual experience of sectarianism. Sectarian behaviour in the form of crime and discrimination, it found, to be fairly uncommon.

The Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2003 requires that all crimes which are alleged to have been motivated by religious prejudice be noted by the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service in Scotland. A review between June and September 2004 looked at gender, ethnicity and religion of the victim and offender as well as motive, venue and timing of the offence. 108 cases were taken into consideration. 82 (76%) incidents took place in the West of Scotland, 58 (54%) in Glasgow and 24 (22%) in Lanarkshire. Of these alcohol was a feature in 53 (49%) cases; in 39 (36%) cases police were the target of verbal abuse; there were twice as many Catholic as Protestant victims, 68 (63%) Catholics and 31 (29%) Protestants; 105 (90%) of the accused were male within the age range of 21-40. 15 (14%) of the incidents were football-related and 16 (15%) occurred within the context of marches.

The Crown Office advised that this was not a detailed research project. Presumably no hard conclusions could be expected to be reached.

Nevertheless, the reaction to this review was predictable. Spokespersons for the Catholic Church viewed these statistics as irrefutable evidence of the continued prejudice facing the Catholic population in Scotland. This was robustly disputed by others who claimed that most of the incidents, 99 (92%), were breaches of the peace involving a small proportion of young men in a particular context - alcohol, football or marches. They argued that sectarian identity provides a convenient vocabulary of insults and has nothing to do with religion.

Discussions

Denominational Schools

The 1918 Education (Scotland) Act transferred to the Educational Authorities the voluntary or denominational schools, Roman Catholic and Episcopalian, which had previously been grant-aided but not rate-aided. There were express safeguards about religious instruction and the religious persuasion of the teachers employed. The attitude of the EIS at the time to the transferred schools was supportive, given the nature of difficulties faced by these schools in providing adequate education for young people and the extent of poverty which existed within the Catholic community.

"Their schools were under government inspection and received Government grants but they got no assistance from the rates. Their maintenance imposed a severe strain upon the resources of the Churches and they compared unfavourably with the board schools in premises, equipment and staffing. The provisions of the Act left those Churches little option but to bring their schools within the national system of education. Even the government grants depended upon their doing so.....

The compromise thus effected has met with general acceptance and has worked well. From an educational point of view the benefit to the children of the transferred schools has been enormous, and this alone would justify the settlement."

(AJ Belford, Centenary Handbook of the Educational Institute of Scotland, 1946, p284 Chapter X, Religious Education)

In 1918 the EIS supported the establishment of the denominational sector within the terms of the legislation as it recognised the social, political and economic conditions which gave rise to the Act.

During discussions with the various contributors reference was made to the existence of separate state-funded Catholic schools. Members of the Catholic Church expressed concern that any time violent, sectarian - related incidents take place, the ensuing debate focuses on the continued existence of Catholic schools as the reason for such behaviour. The Church of Scotland did not feel it had a right to comment on the separate schools issue other than to welcome the diversity of provision. They agreed that it could be argued that the non-denominational sector was predominantly influenced by the Church of Scotland.

Neither the Church of Scotland nor the Catholic Church is of the opinion that Catholic schools are the reason for sectarianism.

The EIS Annual General Meeting of 1979 debated the issue of separate schools. The policy position which emerged from this debate, as reported in the Scottish Educational Journal in October 1979, was that “the Institute should remain committed to the view that the agreement of the Catholic community is an essential prerequisite of any movement towards the integration of denominational and non-denominational schools.” The debate continued in the intervening Council meetings and was upheld by the 1980 Annual General Meeting.

The representatives from the Scottish Catholic Education Service expressed a view on shared campuses. The introduction of shared campuses gives rise to fears within the Catholic community that it is another attack on Catholic schools. Some of the proposals by local authorities which had been opposed were opposed because of the perception that attitudinal sectarianism existed, sometimes strongly, in those communities and that neither group of parents wanted or were ready for a shared campus. There was, in their view, no reason for shared campuses where large and viable Catholic schools existed. Where, however, falling rolls made both non-denominational and Catholic schools within their communities less viable the Catholic Church would not necessarily be opposed to shared campuses.

The EIS has argued the case for comprehensive education consistently over many years. In its 1999 policy paper on inclusive education, it states that it “will campaign for an inclusive education system which recognises the equality of all learners; within this structure each school should be inclusive and flexible, enabling a wide range of pupils to learn in that school.”

The EIS believes firmly in Scottish children being educated in a comprehensive system within their local communities and has campaigned to ensure that comprehensive education is a reality in Scotland. The prime motives behind this work have been our commitment to equality and our conviction that the most effective means of promoting equality and sound learning is a system of comprehensive education. Within our comprehensive education system and schools it is important to recognise the different needs of schools and communities. The EIS recognises also that the debates on comprehensive education have moved on and that it is important to consider the context within which we have to work.

The media and football

Among the issues discussed by the Working Group was the role of the media and football in Scotland.

The media is driven by the search for the story that sells. The video of a senior law figure in Scotland singing sectarian songs, a lecture by a noted musician of Irish-Catholic origin, and the tragic murder of a young man after a football match in Glasgow were covered widely, at length, and with varying quality, in the Scottish media.

A Panorama programme, “Scotland’s Secret Shame”, 2005, explored sectarianism by taking the cameras onto the streets of Glasgow in a sometimes sensationalist, but nevertheless disturbing, look at the attitudes of some people.

“This is a film about two communities, one Protestant, the other Catholic, and the centuries’ old rivalry between them. It’s also a film about two of the biggest football clubs in the world, and about violence where wearing the wrong colour could mark you out for attack, even death, and this in Britain in the 21st century.” (Samantha Poling, presenter ‘Scotland’s Secret Shame’ transcript from BBC Panorama, February 2005)

A poll of 1034 Scots conducted in May 2004, on behalf of Radio Five Live’s research for a programme also called ‘Scotland’s Secret Shame’, indicated that almost one in five Scots has experienced some form of sectarianism. It suggested that most people believe sectarian hatred will continue across future generations, despite there being no substantive evidence for this view in the statistics available within Scotland.

The media helps individuals in confirming and creating their construct of society, in their knowledge of the rest of the world and in their values and attitudes.

In relation to sectarianism, they can reinforce the belief in its pervasive effects on society as they concentrate on stories of abuse and violence at football matches, or Orange parades. The amount of media attention given to Old Firm matches, the coverage given to the ‘Marching Season’, and editorial comment continues to fuel sectarian opinions and emotions. Headlines can be irresponsible e.g. ‘Attack after Old Firm Match’ described a mugging which took place on the evening of an Old Firm match but which was unrelated to the game. Equally, headlines can be based on the undisputed facts of sectarianism. At certain events sectarian abuses do occur and do have tragic consequences.

The media can lead in showing a controlled and responsible attitude to sectarianism by responsible reporting which in turn will allow individuals to develop an informed opinion. The challenge to sectarianism in the Scottish media is growing with many sections of the media unequivocal in their opposition to sectarian behaviour. However, some argue that the Scottish media is guilty of maintaining on the whole an almost ‘eerie silence’ about the issue.

The extent to which this behaviour, arguably by a minority of the population, and the media coverage of this behaviour, translates into wholesale discrimination in the workplace, society and the provision of services is the main question to be answered. Are these attitudes, so tragically on display at certain football matches, also hiding behind ‘a respectable veneer’ in society as stated in the Northern Ireland Community Council document?

One view suggests that to confer on football this level of influence is to exaggerate its power in society beyond the 90 minutes of venom which does exist on the terracing of not only Old Firm matches. It suggests that there are such beings as ‘90 minute’ bigots.

On the contrary, the other perspective argues that the Old Firm is enormously influential. This influence extends beyond the city in which both are based. Such deeply ingrained attitudes are not confined to a minority of football supporters over a 90 minute period but are expressions of a deeper malaise within Scottish society which remains, as ‘Scotland’s Secret Shame’, within its institutions and structures.

The fact that certain parts of Scotland, particularly in the West, can be described still in the twenty-first century as Catholic or Protestant, Celtic or Rangers, is not to exaggerate its influence. Both clubs put considerable effort into eradicating sectarianism among their respective supporters through e.g. ‘Pride not Prejudice’ and ‘Bhoys against Bigotry’. Such action is recognition of the damage sectarianism inflicts not only on the clubs but on young people and society and that it finds expression at football matches.

Trade unions

Trades unions in Scotland and the STUC are committed to stamping out sectarianism in the workplace and in society. They have worked, and continue to work, closely with the Scottish Executive, voluntary groups and within the Scottish Parliament in support of the various anti-sectarian initiatives.

This paper has not attempted to look at all the research which may shed light on the role of trades unions in the past. Much of the sectarianism which may have existed would have reflected the prevailing political divisions and employment practices of the times. Some large industrial plants, for

example, did have hiring policies which selected along sectarian lines but there is little evidence of mass opposition or otherwise from trades unions. Evidence could be found, if there was any, in motions to Annual General Meetings which come through branches to the national body. More research is required to provide a clearer picture of attitudes within trades unions towards sectarian practices.

The periods identified in the paper as significant in the development of sectarianism, post-1916 Easter Rising, the inter-war years and the 'troubles' of the 1970s, were looked at for evidence of sectarian practices within trades unions. During these periods the trade union movement in Scotland did not have its troubles to seek: the First World War and post-war period, 'Red Clydeside', the General Strike, economic downturns and economic reconstruction. In the interwar period, over 550,000 Scots left their country to find work elsewhere. By 1932 average male unemployment was just under thirty per cent for Scotland as a whole, and over fifty per cent for many mining and shipbuilding areas. Throughout the 1960s and 70s, there was another period of reconstruction, government intervention in creation of employment opportunities, for example, steel and motor industry; slum demolition in deprived city areas, house-building programmes and the continued development of new towns.

The EIS supported the provisions in the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918, to establish denominational schools. In the 1920s and 30s, there is no evidence in the journals of the EIS of support for or opposition to sectarianism. There was a reference in the President's address to the 1932 Annual General Meeting to the positive changes in the quality of educational provision for Catholics as a result of the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918. The issue of segregated schools featured in 1979 after a motion to the Annual General Meeting in June called for integration of schools. This position was further debated by EIS council, 1979 - 1980 and amended to that which remains EIS policy (paragraph vi, page 12).

Conclusion

There is considerable political interest in eradicating sectarianism from Scottish society. Either this is an overreaction to a major historical but now irrelevant and disappearing problem or it is an admission of the existence of discrimination on a scale requiring to be rooted out and is indeed Scotland's shame.

It was notable that the initiatives and publications sourced by the Working Group and the contributors to the group referred to religious hatred generally and the existence of sects within most religions, not always hostile to each other. All returned to the specifics of the Irish Catholic/ Protestant divide in Scotland. This is unsurprising as it is this divide which is most visible, permeates much of the history of Scottish society and gives rise to most concern.

To lay out even a brief account of the history of sectarianism in Scotland is to beg criticism. It is complex and set amidst people's religion, traditions, personal stories and folklore. Every nation has these but not every nation purporting to be a modern democratic society has sections of the community so adamant in their adherence to them or spurred to acts of violence in their defence.

Sectarianism was a problem; it existed and had an impact on considerable numbers of people. It still does exist and although the number affected may be smaller, the impact on those so affected is no less. The fact that successive polls suggest people still are aware of it, even at the most tender age, that some are driven to violence and abuse through adherence to sectarian views, requires action to challenge it. It remains, to varying degrees, at a structural, institutional, cultural and personal level within Scottish society.

Social surveys have identified a generational gulf in attitudes about religion and sectarianism. Many young people today, regardless of their religious persuasion or otherwise, look with bewilderment on the bigotry of their parents and grandparents, but others do not. To them, ignoring the past is a betrayal of the causes and sacrifices of their predecessors. They have a right to celebrate their culture and diversity through songs and stories.

The limited crime statistics available since the passing of the Criminal Justice Scotland Act, 2003, show that the number of young men involved in sectarian abuse is a cause for concern. This concern is

not only because of the violent nature of the abuse but the circumstances of that abuse and the social background of those involved.

The Scottish Executive is to be commended in providing a lead to Scotland in challenging sectarianism. Nil By Mouth and Sense Over Sectarianism have shown how much excellent work can be carried out. The efforts of those in football clubs, the media, representative organisations and churches must also be commended. However, they must continue to examine their past and present and admit to their role in promoting sectarianism and their response to it today.

Setting sectarianism, real or perceived, within the broader context of anti-discrimination e.g. sexism, racism and class allows a gateway or a structure to explore the issue without attitudes becoming entrenched or blame apportioned the moment the word sectarianism is mentioned.

The view of the trade union movement is that 'an injury to one is an injury to all'. It supports the One Scotland, Many Cultures initiative. It believes that the impact of discriminatory actions, even of a small minority of the population, is unacceptable.

It is essential to balance the democratic rights of people to celebrate their past, their religion, their beliefs and to demonstrate peaceably with the rights of people to criminal and social justice, the right to employment, the right to live in safety and the right to tolerance of religious and other beliefs.

The fact that sectarianism exists in Scotland is shameful but it is no secret. There are difficult issues of history, oppression, real and perceived, which must be recognised. There were, and are, victims of sectarian behaviour. Its continuation at any level is incompatible with the vision of a multi-cultural, progressive democratic country to which Scotland aspires.

Whether Sectarianism is structural or attitudinal, real or perceived, there is a problem. It is everybody's business to challenge it.

Recommendations

Education has a central role to play in creating a greater awareness of the complexity of prejudice and discrimination; an understanding of their origins in societal structures and the recognition that anti-discriminatory strategies cannot be challenged by educational efforts alone. Local authorities and educational establishments play an educational role and should help counter myth and misrepresentation.

EIS nationally should:

- recognise the role education plays in combating sectarianism
- recognise the opportunities available in A Curriculum for Excellence with specific reference to the values and ethos outlined within the Programme to tackle sectarianism and discrimination
- seek opportunities to work with the Scottish Executive's anti-sectarian initiative, particularly action points 1-4, (Appendix 7) and also with organisations such as Sense over Sectarianism to help develop meaningful national strategy
- continue to support a fully comprehensive non-denominational education system in line with current EIS policy (see page 12)
- challenge employment practices which can be perceived as discriminatory by all means possible
- support members in examining their attitude to sectarianism by holding a seminar
- monitor closely the development of joint campus schools; support staff within them and raise any issue relating to a link between joint campus schools and areas of deprivation where there are falling school roles
- develop policy on shared campuses
- consider examining the language used in discussing this topic to ensure that it is not itself discriminatory
- look at further sectarian issues

Local associations should:

- Encourage support for local anti-sectarian initiatives
- Raise awareness of the issue
- Consider holding seminars or meetings

Schools and Branches should:-

- seek to ensure that anti-sectarianism is part of the equality agenda in establishments
- consider whether practices in their establishment, intentionally or otherwise, contribute to either institutional or attitudinal sectarianism
- promote anti-sectarian attitudes and practices and find appropriate ways to challenge and address sectarianism;

Members should:-

- examine their attitudes to sectarianism and practices in the light of the information presented in this document.

Appendix 1

The Nil By Mouth Charter for Change

Sectarianism, racism and bigotry have no place in a modern Scotland. Everyone's religious beliefs should be respected and cultural diversity should be celebrated.

Everyone should be encouraged to remember this and to take responsibility for the language they use and the way they behave. In this way we can all help to change our society for the better.

In addition we call on:

- The Scottish Executive and local authorities to promote anti-sectarianism throughout the education system.
- Rangers and Celtic Football Clubs to agree and announce measurable targets to reduce sectarian behaviour amongst their supporters.
- Employers to make clear in their recruitment and employment processes that they do not tolerate any form of sectarianism or bigotry.
- Voluntary organisations, sports clubs, public bodies and businesses to include a commitment to non-sectarianism in their constitutions, mission statements and application forms.
- The Scottish Parliament to monitor how the police, the Crown Office and the Courts apply Section 74 of the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2003.
- The Churches to preach a strong anti-sectarian message and to work together in partnership across the diversity of faiths followed in Scotland.

Appendix 2

The Church of Scotland, Committee on Church and Nation, Report to The General Assembly, 2002

Foreword

The reason for publishing this report on Sectarianism is summed up in the theme running through it: "Sectarianism is not someone else's problem". It is our hope that, by considering the contents of the report, the readers will be moved to consider for themselves and for their communities the challenges it poses.

What are the prejudices I carry around, often without noticing? What are the ways in which I blame others for separation, when I could be doing something myself? Are there things I could be changing in myself or in the circles in which I belong?

The General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, when it received this report in May 2002, expressed its regret for actions in the past. It also called on congregations to study this matter for themselves in their own contexts – and to adopt for themselves the Nil-by-Mouth Charter.

It is our hope that many will do so, so that we can all tackle that quiet, hidden, often 'polite' prejudice which can erupt into anger, threat, intimidation and violence – scarring individuals, communities and our whole society.

Our thanks go to the Drummond Trust for their financial support of this publication.

The Committee on the Church and Nation would be interested to receive news of the results of any discussions congregations have as a result of it.

Alan McDonald, Convener, Church and Nation Committee.

Instruct the Church and Nation Committee to carry out a study of the adverse effects of sectarianism within Scottish society and report to the General Assembly of 2002 and encourage all who work throughout the Church to work to overcome sectarian barriers. (General Assembly 2002)

1. Introduction

1.1 The format of this report reflects the process undertaken by the Committee. We realised at an early stage that it would not be wise to rush to conclusions about what is a large and complex subject. We have instead approached the topic in a spirit of humility and with an attitude of listening. The style and content reflect what we have learned from the conversations we have had, the reading we have done and the research we have carried out. We offer our recommendations not as 'experts' but as those that have participated in and seek to reflect Scottish society as experienced in 2001-2002.

1.2 Although the report is limited to sectarianism between Protestant and Catholic, it is our contention that much of what has been learned is readily applicable to other forms of bigotry and intolerance, evident in Scottish society today.

Sectarianism in Scotland today....

Is seen and heard in the small asides which say little and reveal much.

Is most publicly evident in behaviour associated with football matches but is by no means confined to this.

Is, thanks to recent legislation and changing patterns in society, less blatant than before in employment and recruitment practices but continues to generate claims of prejudice in the work situation.

Is still, in its most extreme form, ugly, intimidating and murderous, including a series of attacks on a priest in Easterhouse and the murders of eleven Rangers and Celtic football fans since 1995;

Is still very much in the public eye, generating extensive media coverage and comment.

Is capable of demonstrating itself throughout Scotland. It is not limited to cities and urban communities.

Is pervasive and will continue to be so unless we are willing to search our own consciences and to review our own language, attitudes and actions.

Sectarian is not someone else's problem. It is an issue for all of us.

Appendix 3

A CHARTER for CATHOLIC SCHOOLS in SCOTLAND

The mission of the Catholic school is to develop as a community of faith and learning, providing the highest quality of education, and offering formation through the promotion of Gospel values, through celebration and worship, and through service to the common good.

All Catholic schools in Scotland, in honouring Jesus Christ as the Way, the Truth and the Life, will feature the following characteristics:

- a commitment to the integrated education and formation of the whole person, in close partnership with parents as the first educators of their children;
- an inclusive ethos which aims to honour the life, dignity and voice of each person, made in the image of God;
- a commitment to the search for wisdom in life and to the pursuit of excellence, through the development of each person's unique God-given talents;
- a commitment to the spiritual formation of the school community, through the shared experience of prayer and liturgy, and in partnership with local parishes;
- the provision of religious education programmes which will enable young people to develop their understanding of Gospel values and of how to apply them to life;
- a commitment to uphold the moral teaching, faith tradition and sacramental life of the Catholic Church;
- a commitment to communicate Catholic social teaching and thereby to promote social justice and opportunity for all;
- a commitment to ecumenical action and the unity of Christians;
- the promotion of respect for different beliefs and cultures and for inter-faith dialogue;
- a commitment to support the continuing professional and spiritual development of staff.

All staff appointed to a Catholic school are expected to support and promote the aims, mission, values and ethos of the school, as illustrated in this Charter.

Appendix 4

Summit on Sectarianism 14 February 2005

Introduction from the First Minister

For far too long bigoted sectarian behaviour has been a scar on Scottish life. The images of abusive and violent behaviour that result tell the world that Scotland is not yet free of past prejudices. But it doesn't need to be like this. Our small country has a big future. Devolution has given us a historic opportunity to build a strong, healthy society, one where every Scot, regardless of their background, can be confident of success. We must make the most of that opportunity.

Bigoted sectarian attitudes have no place in 21st-century Scotland. The Summit on Sectarianism on 14 February 2005 brought together key representatives, from a broad range of interests, to discuss working together to tackle sectarianism. I was pleased that those who attended welcomed the initiative. Discussion focused on four key themes of interfaith, education, sport and marches and parades. We consider these central to the work that needs to be taken forward. I hope you find this record of the Summit interesting.

The Summit was only the next step in a long-term process. We still have a long way to go. A clear agreement emerged to work together to tackle sectarian bigotry. I gave a commitment to develop, in partnership, a national action plan to tackle sectarianism. This will build on the desire for change and the shared commitment to work to make a real and lasting difference for the benefit of the people of Scotland now and in the future.

Rt Hon Jack McConnell MSP

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J McConnell', with a stylized initial 'J'.

Appendix 5

REPORT OF CROSS-PARTY WORKING GROUP ON RELIGIOUS HATRED

Chapter 1 Introduction

This Report sets out the conclusions of the Cross-Party Working Group on Possible Legislation to Tackle Religious Hatred in Scotland. It considers whether legislation is necessary or desirable, readily capable of enforcement and likely to lead to the reduction of sectarianism and other forms of religious hatred. The Group has also considered whether there are other, more appropriate ways to tackle the issue of religious hatred and send a strong signal to the public that there is no place for bigotry in today's Scotland. The **overall conclusion** of the Group was that there were strong arguments for legislation but these should not overshadow the need for changes in practice, culture and attitudes to combat religious prejudice on a wider front.

From the past to the present

Religious differences form the background to much of Scotland's history since the Middle Ages. There has been a recognisable element of religion running through Scottish politics down the centuries - from the introduction of Christianity, the Reformation and the troubled reign of Mary Queen of Scots, the Solemn League and Covenant, the "Glorious Revolution" and the Jacobite Rebellions. Within living memory it has been an open secret that some employers would not appoint people of a particular faith. While there was some evidence of anti-semitism in pre-1940's Great Britain, casually expressed in literature in the same way as other examples of discrimination, the history of religious division in Scotland up until the mid 20th century was largely one of inter-Christian sectarianism.

More recent immigration from further afield, an improvement in world communications and more relaxed attitudes have brought a bigger diversity of religious faith to Scotland and also a growing constituency of people who would say that they are of no religious faith. Sometimes the expression of religious belief will involve expressing genuine but respectful disagreement with someone else's belief. But at times so-called "religious differences" can be used as a pretext for intolerance, racism and cultural imperialism, for insulting behaviour and for acts of violence. Much of the media attention regarding inter-Christian sectarianism in Scotland focuses on the attitudes and behaviour of certain football fans - but religious intolerance can go much wider than that.

To consider meaningfully the issue of religious hatred, we believe it is important to acknowledge the many crossovers between religion, culture, history, race, politics and patriotic feeling. It can sometimes be difficult to dissociate religion from all these factors. As just one example, criticism of the Israeli/Palestinian conflict in the Middle East sometimes draws accusations of racism or religious discrimination, including anti-Semitism and Islamophobia.

Recent political developments

Religious hatred is clearly a matter of concern to all right-minded citizens and there have been a number of political developments recently which have sought to tackle the problem through legislation. Article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights provides that:

"Everyone has the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion; this right includes freedom to change his religion or belief and freedom, either alone or in community with others and in public or private, to manifest his religion or belief, in worship, teaching, practice and observance.

Freedom to manifest one's religion or beliefs shall be subject only to such limitations as are prescribed by law and are necessary in a democratic society in the interests of public safety, for the protection of public order, health or morals, or for the protection of the rights and freedoms of others."

Article 13 of the Treaty of Amsterdam includes an Employment Directive which requires member states to make discrimination unlawful on grounds of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation in the areas of employment and training. It also includes a Race Directive, which requires member states to make discrimination on grounds of racial or ethnic origin unlawful in the following areas: employment, training, education, access to social security and health care, social advantages and access to goods and services, including housing.

In July 2001, Dennis Canavan MSP wrote as convener of the Cross-Party Sports Group to the then First

Minister about proposals he had received from the Old Firm (Rangers and Celtic football clubs) for tackling sectarianism in football and in Scottish society more generally. The First Minister responded welcoming the approach taken by the clubs and highlighting the need for the different agencies involved to work together to achieve most of the aims.

In June 2001, Donald Gorrie MSP lodged a proposal for a Bill in the Scottish Parliament to make sectarian behaviour an aggravation of a criminal offence. The intention of this would be to attract more punitive sentences for offences which were committed with a sectarian motivation. He also proposed the creation of a code of conduct on tackling sectarian behaviour. Mr Gorrie's consultation on his proposed Bill drew almost 100 responses, most of which expressed support for his objectives. However, under the rules of the Scottish Parliament on the drafting of Private Members' Bills, the setting up of this Working Group on Religious Hatred had the effect of suspending work on drafting the Bill. Mr Gorrie has brought forward new proposals for an amendment to the Criminal Justice Bill currently being considered in the Scottish Parliament. These proposals if enacted would make the motivation of religious or sectarian hatred an aggravation of a criminal offence.

On 15 October 2001, the UK Home Secretary announced that he intended to include measures to counter religiously-motivated crime in the Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Bill. He proposed, amongst other things, to widen the existing law to cover incitement to religious hatred and to create a new category of religiously-aggravated offences to complement the racially-aggravated offences created by the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. During the passage of the Bill the Home Secretary withdrew the provisions on incitement to religious hatred after the House of Lords twice voted against them. However, the separate provisions on religiously-aggravated offences in England and Wales received Royal Assent in December 2001. See Annex A for an outline of the relevant provisions. At the time of writing, there have been three prosecutions under the new provisions in England and Wales, one of which has proceeded to conviction. The House of Lords have set up a Religious Offences Committee to consider the law on blasphemy and the wider issue of religious hatred offences.

During a debate in the Scottish Parliament on 15 November 2001 about the UK Parliament's Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Bill, Iain Gray (then Deputy Justice Minister) indicated that the Executive considered that the existing law in Scotland had been sufficient to deal firmly with religious hatred. The Executive therefore did not consider it appropriate for the Bill's provisions on religious hatred to extend to Scotland. Nevertheless he announced that the Executive would convene a cross-party working group to consider whether there was a need for any new legislation on this issue in Scotland. We are that group and this report is the result of our deliberations.

Appendix 6

(ANALYSIS OF RELIGION IN THE 2001 CENSUS: Summary Report
Office of the Chief Statistician, February 2005, www.scotland.gov.uk)

Table 1.2: Current Religion and Religion of Upbringing – All People
Column Percentages

	Current Religion (%)	Religion of Upbringing (%)	% Difference (+/-)
Church of Scotland	42.40	47.27	4.87
Roman Catholic	15.88	16.98	1.10
Other Christian	6.81	8.38	1.57
Buddhist	0.13	0.09	0.04
Hindu	0.11	0.12	0.01
Jewish	0.13	0.15	0.02
Muslim	0.84	0.83	0.01
Sikh	0.13	0.13	0.00
Another Religion	0.53	0.17	0.37
All Religions	66.96	74.12	7.16
No religion	27.55	17.53	10.02
Not Answered	5.49	8.35	2.86
All no religion / Not answered	33.04	25.88	7.16
Base	5,062,011	5,062,011	

“The Census religion questions (first question asked about current religion and the second asked about religion of upbringing) were both voluntary. Nevertheless, over 94% of people choose to answer the question on current religion. Around 28% of people in Scotland stated that they had no current religion.

Results from other UK Censuses suggest that people in Northern Ireland, England and Wales are more likely to identify with a religion than those in Scotland. Around 86% of people in Northern Ireland and 77% of those in England and Wales report having a religion, compared with only 67% of people in Scotland. However, it is difficult to make a direct comparison since there was only one question asked in England and Wales ‘What is your religion?’ as opposed to the two separate questions which were asked in Scotland. In Northern Ireland, two questions were asked but with a preliminary filter; only those people who did not regard themselves as belonging to any religion were asked to record the religion they were brought up in. Investigations by the Office for National Statistics (ONS) suggest that the responses to the question in England and Wales are most likely to reflect peoples’ religion of upbringing, rather than whether they are currently practising in any faith. Thus it is probably more informative to compare the results from the rest of the UK with the response to the Scottish question on religion of upbringing which shows 74% reporting having been brought up in a faith.”

Appendix 7

Action Plan on Tackling Sectarianism in Scotland (Scottish Executive 2006)

Summary of Actions

1. The Scottish Executive will provide £100,000 during 2006 to support anti-sectarian project work in schools, promote use of the anti-sectarian education resource and develop innovative approaches to tackling sectarianism. The Executive will also provide £13,500 to support the use of the resource in youth work.
2. The Scottish Executive will run seven pilot performances and supporting education workshops of the anti-sectarian play 'Singing I'm No a Billy, He's A Tim', which will involve 700 pupils from across Scotland, by June 2006.
3. The Scottish Executive will produce an information pack for schools and local authorities highlighting the principles of twinning, distilling the good practice examples, illustrating ways to overcome potential barriers, and containing a comprehensive list of twinning activities and contacts. This will be published mid-2006.
4. To raise the profile of the work that is being taken forward to tackle sectarian bigotry at school level, an anti-sectarianism category will be developed for the Scottish Education Awards 2006.
5. To support the National Union of Students Scotland anti-sectarian campaign the Scottish Executive will provide £10,000 to produce a range of materials that can be used by students' associations to ensure that the anti-sectarian message reaches thousands of students in every campus across Scotland during 2006/07.
6. The Scottish Executive will work in partnership with the Scottish Football Association and sportscotland to develop a strategy for tackling sectarianism in football. This will be launched by the end of 2006.
7. The Scottish Executive has appointed an independent facilitator to work with supporters groups of the Scottish Premier League and a selection of Scottish Football League clubs to identify actions that these groups can recommend or take forward to tackle sectarianism. This work will begin early in 2006 and the facilitator will deliver a report on what has been achieved by mid-2006.
8. The Scottish Executive has introduced Football Banning Orders as part of the Police, Public Order and Criminal Justice (Scotland) Bill 2006. The provisions relating to Football Banning Orders will be implemented in autumn 2006.
9. The Scottish Executive will work in partnership with the Scottish Council of Voluntary Organisations to establish a network of anti-sectarian groups and will host annual meetings to facilitate information sharing and the promotion of good practice.
10. The First Minister will meet with Action for Churches Together in Scotland on an annual basis to support the development of co-operative partnerships at the highest level.
11. The Scottish Executive will work in partnership with the National Union of Students Scotland and the Scottish Trades Union Congress Youth Committee to hold a conference bringing young people together to discuss breaking down barriers and developing participation in present-day Scotland. Tackling sectarianism will be high on the agenda.
12. The Scottish Executive will ensure that the legislative provisions on marches and parades being taken forward as part of the Police, Public Order and Criminal Justice (Scotland) Bill 2006 will be implemented by 1 April 2007.
13. Scottish Ministers will issue guidance for local authorities on implementing the recommendations of

the Review of Marches and Parades in Scotland to all 32 Scottish local authorities and other key stakeholders by March 2007.

14. The Scottish Executive will work in partnership with the Accounts Commission and Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary to develop monitoring arrangements to assess the effectiveness of the implementation of the recommendations of the Review of Marches and Parades in Scotland. The first report on activity - covering the period 1 April 2007 to 31 March 2008 - will be produced by July 2008.
15. The Scottish Executive will form a working group of key interests to map out the legal interventions that can currently be used to deal with abusive behaviour at marches and parades. The Group will also be asked to assess the effectiveness of current laws and make recommendations on whether further interventions are required. The Group should make its initial report to Ministers by December 2006.
16. The Scottish Executive will work in partnership with the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service to review the reports received under the Section 74 of the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2006 for the period 1 January 2004 to 30 June 2005 and provide an in-depth analysis of cases throughout this period by mid-2006.
17. The Scottish Executive and Sense Over Sectarianism will fund the Scottish Trades Union Congress to carry out research into the effect of sectarianism in the workplace and to make recommendations as to how any identified problems might be addressed. The research will be completed by September 2006.
18. The Scottish Executive will establish a Task Group on Tackling Sectarianism in Scotland early in 2006 to make recommendations on new areas and initiatives where positive action can be taken to tackle sectarianism in the long term. The Group will also produce a report on its activities one year after inception.

Reading List

EIS, Inclusive Education, *Policy Papers 1998/99*

Abbotts, J., Williams, R., West, P., Hunt, K., Ford, G., (2004) 'Catholic Socio-Economic Disadvantage in the West of Scotland: A Narrowing of Inequality', *Scottish Affairs No 49*, pp 77-87, Edinburgh

Brett, J., (2003) *Australian Liberals and the Moral Middle Class : From Alfred Deakin to John Howard*, Cambridge University Press

Bruce, S., Glendinning, A., Paterson, I. & Rosie, M., (2004) *Sectarianism in Scotland*, Edinburgh University Press

Devine, T, M., (1999) *The Scottish Nation : A History 1700 to 2000*, Penguin

Finn, G, P, T., (1999) *Sectarianism and Scottish Education. Scottish Education* (1st Edition)

Finn G, P, T., (2003) 'Sectarianism: A Challenge for Scottish Education' in Bryce, T. & Hume W., *Scottish Education* (2nd Edition), pp897-907

Greenaway, H., (2004) Scots fear bigotry will always be with us, *The Herald May 2004*

Hickman, M & Bronwen, W., (1997) *Discrimination in the Irish Community in Britain*, A report of research undertaken for the Commission for Racial Equality, London

Kelly, E., (2003) 'Challenging Sectarianism in Scotland: The Prism of Racism', *Scottish Affairs No 42*, pp32-56, Edinburgh

Kelly, E., (August 2003) *Social Inclusion in Scotland: Thinking about issues of Faith* (Stirling Conference)

Kelly, E., (April 26 2004) *Sectarianism Today - Two Steps Forward, One Step Back* (Dundee Conference)

NFO Social Research, (2003) *Sectarianism in Glasgow - Final report*, Glasgow City Council

Northern Ireland Council for Integrated Education (1998) *The Anti-Bias Curriculum: Educating Children Together*, pp14-24

Office of Chief Statistician (2005), *Analysis of Religion Data in the 2001 Census*, HMSO

Orr, John Sir (2005) *Review of Marches and Parades in Scotland*, Edinburgh

Paterson, L. Bechhofer, F., & McCrone, D., (2004) *Living in Scotland: Social and Economic Change since 1980*, Edinburgh University Press

Rosie, M., (2004) *Sectarian Myth in Scotland: Of Bitter Memory and Bigotry*, Palgrave Macmillan

Scottish Executive (2002) *Tackling Religious Hatred: Report of the Cross Party Working Group on Religious Hatred*, Edinburgh

Scottish Executive, (2004) *Tackling Religious Hatred: Update on the recommendations of the Cross Party Working Group on Religious Hatred*, Edinburgh

Scottish Executive, (2005) *Record of the Summit on Sectarianism*, Edinburgh

Scottish Executive, (2006) *Sectarianism: Action Plan on Tackling Sectarianism in Scotland*, Edinburgh

Scottish Executive Social Research (2004) *Religious Discrimination & Sectarianism in Scotland: A Brief Review of Evidence (2002 -2004)*, Edinburgh

Scottish Executive Social Research (2005) *Review of Marches and Parades: A survey of Views across Scotland*, Edinburgh

Smith, A., (April 26 2004) *Sectarianism: Global Perspectives* (Dundee Conference)

The Church of Scotland Committee on Church and Nation, *A Report to the General Assembly 1923, The Menace of the Irish Race to our Scottish Nationality*

The Church of Scotland Committee on Church and Nation, *Report to the General Assembly 2002, The Demon in our Society: Sectarianism in Scotland*

Web sites

Burdsey, D., and Chappell, R., '*And If You Know Your History*', *An Examination of the Formation of Football Clubs in Scotland and their Role in the Construction of Social Identity* www2.umist.ac.uk/sport/SPORTS%20HISTORY/BSSH

Rashid, A., *The Politics and Dynamics of Violent Sectarianism*
http://members.tripod.com/~no_nukes_sa/chapter_2.html

Sanders, A., (2005) *Football and Sectarianism: A Background Picture*
www.heartsfc.premiumtv.co.uk

Scottish Executive : Don't give it Don't take it
www.ltscotland.org.uk/antisectarian

Smyth, M., and Moore, R., (2005) *Researching Sectarianism*
www.ccruni.gov.uk

Other

Gorrie, D., (October 2001), *Protection from Sectarianism and Religious Hatred: A Proposed Bill*, Scottish Parliament